



ASSESSING TEACHERS' PREFERENCE TOWARDS TEXTBOOKS PROVIDED BY PRIVATE-SECTOR PUBLISHERS

Nabilla Ulayya Musyafa¹, Slamet Riyadi², Novita Pri Andini³
Universitas Jenderal Soedirman
nabilla.musyafa@mhs.unsoed.ac.id

Received: 2024/10/10

Accepted: 2024/09/01

Available Online: 2024/09/30

Abstract

This study aims to investigate the factors influencing English teachers' preferences for textbooks provided by private-sector publishers, with a focus on teachers in SMP 09 Tegal, Indonesia. The importance of textbooks in the teaching-learning process is crucial, as well as selecting appropriate textbook used in the classroom. Despite the availability of textbooks from both government and private-sector publishers, there is limited research on teachers' preferences in this context. This qualitative study employs a phenomenological approach that involves in-depth interviews and observations of English teachers and students at SMP N 09 Tegal. Participants included three experienced English teachers and one chairman of the MGMP Bahasa Inggris (English Teacher Forum), as well as three students selected through purposive sampling. Data were collected and analyzed thematically to uncover the underlying factors influencing textbook selection, teachers' perception towards the use of private-sector publisher's textbook, and challenges in the use of textbook by private-sector publisher's textbook. The findings reveal that content quality and variety, including the incorporation of practice questions and visual media, are significant factor in teachers' textbook preferences. Teachers also value textbooks' usability, practicality, readability, and the availability of supplementary materials. Despite generally positive perceptions of textbook by private-sector publisher, several challenges have been identified., such as language and content complexity, lack of local context, and infrastructure limitations. Student related challenges include diverse characteristics and varying levels of English proficiency that needs adaptable teaching strategies from teachers. Therefore, this study suggests that government through Ministry of Education, Culture, and Research can make textbook that better suits the needs of students and teachers in the classroom in order to benefit Indonesian education in general.

Keywords: Challenges, English teachers, Private-sector publishers, Teachers' perceptions, Teachers' preference



Introduction

In classroom practice, textbook is essential for teaching-learning process. It is said that textbook is considered as one of the most important elements in the classroom (Mohammadi & Abdi, 2014). Without textbook, the teaching learning process will be lacking in practice. The textbooks used in the classroom was chosen by the corresponding teacher with the recommendation made by MGMP Bahasa Inggris (English Teacher Forum), in EFL teachers' case, it is the English teacher's correspondence. It means that the responsibility of selecting an appropriate textbook lies in the hands of teacher.

There are plenty of textbook choices outside, the ones that is provided by government/ internal publishers (Ministry of Education) and private-sector publishers (book sellers outside authorized publishers). This means that the teachers have the opportunity to select and evaluate the textbook that meets the needs and requirements of their students. The role of teacher is crucial in selecting the appropriate textbook for their students because the teachers know their class better than anyone else.

Textbook selection is crucial for teaching learning process. The textbook selected by the teachers should suit the teacher's learning plan. The relationship between teacher and coursebook is an important consideration and is at its best when it is a partnership which shares common goals to which each side brings its special contribution (Cunningsworth, 1995, p.7). It solely means that the teachers and textbook cannot be separated each other. They have to be connected each other and share the same objectives. Its partnership helps to ensure that the teachers maximize the potential for expected learning outcomes.

Despite the importance of textbook selection, there is no significant amount of study that talked about the textbook selection and preference among Indonesian English teachers. According to preliminary study conducted earlier by the researcher, it has become phenomena where teachers prefer using Lembar Kerja Siswa (LKS)/ Textbook provided by private-sector publishers than textbook provided by the Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC) among English teachers in Tegal. The decision and preference of English teachers in Tegal raised questions regarding the factors that might influence this choice and its potential effect for English language education at Indonesian school.

Mastering public speaking is crucial for teachers, as these skills are essential for everyone, particularly in building a successful career and fostering positive relationships. That is because a teacher can easily communicate with students and be easily understood by students as well as possible, so there is understanding regarding the information. A teacher's delivery needs to be paid attention correctly because what a teacher says will be immediately imitated by the students, so a



teacher must be able to communicate clearly with appropriate words. Teachers who can communicate effectively with their students can organize them efficiently during teaching and learning sessions in the classroom. Additionally, such teachers can manage the classroom environment effectively, enabling students to grasp the teaching and learning objectives easily. Moreover, students are more likely to be self-motivated in their learning efforts.

In an effort of understanding teachers' preference in Indonesian context, the researcher has to choose schools that located in Indonesia, preferably in the location that is convenient for the researcher within the context. In this case, the researcher decided to choose SMP N 09 Tegal as the location. This school was chosen due to its strategic location and its potential. The school is located at Martoloyo street number 62, Tegal, which also situated in the Pantura, that allows students with various background become students there. With various background of students, it was expected that the researcher gets broader and better understanding related to teachers' preference in choosing textbook for students that comes from various background.

Furthermore, there was no significant amount of existing research focusing in textbook selection and teachers' preference using phenomenology approach. Phenomenology approach is a careful description and analyses of the subjects' life world and the meaning making and understanding in that life world (Flick, 2010). The research aimed to provide insights related to textbook selection among Indonesian English teachers, especially in junior high school level, and to explore the factors in determining English textbooks used by Indonesian English teachers. As mentioned above, textbook has an important part in teaching-learning process. Therefore, choosing the right textbook is a vital part of planning for effective learning. selecting textbook must be done in systematic way. It has to be done from identifying the aims to collecting advice from colleagues. Identifying the aims and objectives when selecting textbook is important as it makes the learning process' directions clear (Cunningsworth, 1995). With the use of textbook, it is clear kinds of materials that they will learn, how far will they learn, and what output is expected from teaching-learning process for one semester.

In using textbook, both complementary and supplementary materials, English teachers often face several challenges. Oftentimes, the challenge is in form of the textbook and supplementary materials that is not reflecting and validating the diverse of students' cultural background (Gay, 2018, p. 148). When students have their textbook lacks of cultural relevance with their daily life, students may feel disconnected. This can lead into disengagement in teaching learning process and difficulties in understanding the materials.

It is commonly known that textbooks play important role in teaching-learning process. The selection of the textbook used in the classroom is the corresponding teacher's authority. The teacher has the right to choose the textbook that suits his



or her class while making sure that the textbook chosen meet the students' needs. However, the process of textbook selection is greatly influenced by the teachers' preference.

The preference of a teacher in selecting textbook may vary one another. First, the content quality of a textbook might become the important aspect to be considered. According to Oakes and Saunders (2002), the quality of textbook is defined by its content quality and variety of its content. They believe that clear, interesting writing style, current, accurate, and comprehensive content are essential components of quality textbook. It can be implied that the text inside the textbook should be easily understandable, using appropriate language, engaging for the readers, up to date, factually correct, and covers all necessary topics. Therefore, researching teachers' preference for English textbook in junior high-school is crucial as it affects the overall teaching-learning process.

Research Methodology

This research was a qualitative study that aimed to understand the teachers' reason behind the phenomena of choosing textbooks used in the classroom. Qualitative research was conducted through an intense and/or prolonged contact with a "field" or life situation (Miles & Huberman, 1994). This mean that the research should conduct the research intensively, meaning that the researcher must conduct research until the researcher got a well understanding regarding the problem.

Based on the researcher consideration, phenomenology study was the most appropriate approach to be employed in this study. Phenomenological study described the lived experiences of several people in a concept of a phenomenon (Creswell, 2016, p.76). Yildirim & Şimşek (2011) cited in Vural & Basaran (2021) supported the idea of phenomenology as studies which focus on phenomena that are aware but do not have in-depth and detailed understanding. It can be restated as describing the common thing that participants experienced as they experience the phenomenon, meaning that the participant must be the ones who experienced it directly.

In phenomenological research, the object of the study was the participants' perceptions, feelings, and lived experience (Guest, 2014, p.12). A phenomenology study was chosen because the researcher was intended to understand and describe the reasons behind the teachers' preferences for textbooks provided by specific private-sector publisher that has become phenomena in Tegal area, especially in SMP N 09 Tegal. Furthermore, the use of phenomenology in this research was appropriate due to the intention of the researcher to explore the preferences and attitudes of English teachers.

In this research, the researcher involved both teachers and students to get better understanding regarding the topic. For teachers, the population of this research was English teachers that prefer using textbook by private-sector publishers.



Furthermore, the sample was chosen using purposive sampling, which was only the teachers from the same school, SMPN 09 Tegal, which was only three teachers. As the researcher interviewed participants, it was revealed that the textbook selection was influenced by the suggestion made by MGMP (English Teachers Forum/ Musyawarah Guru Mata Pelajaran). For that reason, the researcher decided to add one more participant to be interviewed, which was the chairman of MGMP.

This research involved students as well, as the core of teaching-learning process in the classroom is students. The students have been interviewed as well, as the students were the center of the learning process. The population of the students were the students from all classroom in SMP N 09 Tegal from grade 7, 8, and 9. The researcher used purposive sampling to choose only three students that would be interviewed. The sample has been chosen through purposive sampling within following criteria: the students who are active in class, preferably who likes English, and diligent to complete assignment given by the teacher in LKS.

To begin the research, the researcher has conducted a preliminary study to support the researchers' hypotheses to avoid any researcher's bias. After validating the accuracy of the researcher's claim, there were two data collection method that were used in this research, those were interviews and observations.

The essential data for this research was collected through recordings from in-depth interview. Interviewing is a method that allows researcher to gain insight into the lives and experiences of their respondents (Leavy, 2014, p.150). This allowed the researcher to gain personal perspective of the participant based on their experience in using LKS (textbook by private-sector publishers) as their main textbook in the classroom.

In conducting in-depth interview, the gathered information was in spoken form. The interview results were usually long and covered broad topic. While taking notes was possible, it was not enough to cover all the topics talked in the interview. Therefore, the researcher decided to record the entire interview session. In this research, the researcher aimed to understand how the teachers utilized the textbook in the classroom through observation. However, the researcher was not involved in the learning process. With that reason, the researcher wanted to conduct a nonparticipant observation. Nonparticipant observation is a qualitative research strategy for gathering primary data about some aspect of the social world without interacting directly with its participant (Dorsten, 2019, p.561). This means, the researcher did not become either students or teacher.

Since the researcher utilized two types of data collection method, the researcher used data triangulation. In this context, the researcher validated data with data source triangulation. Triangulation means that the researcher takes different perspectives in answering research questions (Flick, 2010, p. 417). Here, the



researcher used two kinds of data collection method, those were interviews and observation. The combinations of interview and observation were largely used in the qualitative field. Hopefully, the use of different data source would be capable to answer the research questions adequately.

The data collected through in-depth interview was analyzed using thematic analysis along with inductive method. Thematic analysis is one of qualitative method that aims to search for themes or patterns (Braun & Clarke, 2006). First, data familiarization involves transcribing data, reading data, and writing down initial ideas related to the topic. Second, initial codes development involved systematically coding noteworthy features within the data, gathering relevant information for each code. Third, search for themes involves organizing codes into potential themes, collection of all relevant data to each potential theme. Next, themes review involves validating themes against the coded excerpts (L1) and the entire data set (L2), developing a map of thematic analysis. Fifth, themes defining or naming involves continuously analyzing each of particular theme and the overall interview data the analysis has to tell, generating concise definitions and names of reach theme. Last, report writing involves electing compelling excerpts, conducting final analysis of selected excerpts, connecting the analysis to the research questions and review of literature, writing of report analysis.

Results and Discussion

The data collected for this study are in two forms: interview data, which resulted from a series of interview conducted with several participants and observation checklist, which was collected from several session of non-participant observations. The data gathered through interview became the primary source for this study and has undergone thematic analysis.

Seven participants have become the sole resource of this research becoming the interviewee, which consists of three teachers; they are Anne (P1), Margareth (P2), Sana (P3), the chairman of English Teacher Forum, Hanbin (P4), and three students coming from grade 7, 8 and 9; Luna (P5), Tzuyu (P6) and Yuri (P7). The researcher decided to use pseudonym instead of the participants' real name to ensure participants' confidentiality, which was to prevent the identification of participants who contributed to this research. This is an important ethical safeguard that ensures participants' privacy.

Factors Contributing to English Teachers' Preference towards Textbook from Private-sector Publisher

The first question explored the types of books teachers use in the English teaching-learning process at school. Three out of four teacher participants in the interview used books from private-sector publishers. The first participant (P1) used both government-owned books and private-sector publishers' books,



combining them in her teaching. P2 also mentioned using both kinds of textbooks, utilizing the private-sector publisher's book to enrich and supplement students' learning. P3 specifically used supplementary books from private-sector publishers for homework. P4 indicated that government-provided books were the main resource, but supplementary books from private-sector publishers were used to enhance learning.

The second question delved into the reasons why teachers use the textbooks from private-sector publishers. P1 preferred these textbooks because they are more updated with varied questions and include guidelines, syllabus, and RPP, which government books lack. P2 appreciated the simplicity and variety of questions in the private-sector publisher's book. P3 valued the completeness of these textbooks, which included pictures, exercises, and comprehensive explanations. P4 emphasized the suitability of the materials with the local context of Tegal city, the existence of practice questions, and the collaborative opportunities provided by the publisher.

The third question asked how long teachers have been using the chosen textbooks. P1 stated that she followed the MGMP's (English Teacher Forum) recommendation, which had influenced her choice for the past three years. P2 had been using private-sector publisher's books since 1998, even before MGMP's collaboration with the publisher. P3 had also been using these textbooks since 2004. P4, as the MGMP chairman, confirmed that the collaboration with the private-sector publisher had been ongoing since 2009.

The fourth question focused on the differences between textbooks provided by the Ministry of Education and those by private-sector publishers. P1 mentioned that private-sector publishers' books offer more varied questions. P2 noted that government textbooks have excessive text, lack practice questions, and are outdated, while private-sector publishers' books are more up-to-date but still lack local context. P3 highlighted the completeness of the private-sector publishers' books and the availability of a teacher's handbook. P4 indicated that while there is no significant difference, private-sector publishers' companion books offer more developed materials, examples, and practice questions compared to the government books.

Teachers' Perception towards The Use of Private-sector Publisher's Textbook

The first question in this section asked about the effectiveness of using the chosen textbook in the teaching-learning process. P1 found the textbook provided by the private-sector publisher quite effective, especially when used alongside a dictionary, which encourages students to actively search for vocabulary. P2 emphasized the textbook's usefulness, stating that without it, she would be confused about where to start teaching. P3 also deemed the textbook effective because it eliminated the need for extensive note-taking and allowed students to learn independently through additional assignments. All three teachers highlighted



the textbook's role in saving time and providing comprehensive learning materials.

The second question explored teachers' perceptions of the role of textbooks provided by private-sector publishers in their classrooms. P1 perceived a bigger role for private-sector publishers' textbooks compared to government textbooks, using them more frequently due to their varied content. P2 supported this view by mentioning that the textbook helped students achieve higher scores. P3 highlighted the textbook's role in facilitating immediate reading and working on questions, thus saving time and aiding comprehension. P4 viewed the textbook positively, stating that it facilitated teaching without stifling teachers' creativity and innovation.

The third question focused on whether the materials in textbooks by private-sector publishers provided a balance of activities appropriate for their students. P1 confirmed that these textbooks offered a variety of activities, including reading, listening, writing, and speaking, more so than government textbooks. P2 and P3 also verified the presence of all four aspects of English language learning in these textbooks. However, P3 noted that infrastructural limitations sometimes hindered the implementation of listening activities. P4 explained that the textbooks initially lacked balance but improved over time due to teachers' feedback, which led to the inclusion of all four language skills.

The fourth question asked whether teachers consistently used the same type of LKS (student worksheet) from one single publisher despite changes in the curriculum. P1 confirmed that she always used the same kind of textbook from a particular private-sector publisher because it was consistently updated to align with curriculum changes. She explained that the publisher's ability to adapt to new curricula ensured the continued relevance and effectiveness of their textbooks. This adaptability was also a reason why MGMP (English Teacher Forum) recommended these textbooks, ensuring they met the current educational standards and needs.

Challenges in Using Private-sector Publisher's Textbook

The third part of the interview focused on the challenges faced by English teachers when using private-sector publisher textbooks. P1 highlighted that the varied and up-to-date vocabulary in these textbooks often required her to consult a dictionary or use QR codes, posing a challenge for both teachers and students. P2 pointed out that many 7th graders have no prior knowledge of English, necessitating teaching from the basics and making it difficult for students to differentiate between vocabulary types. In contrast, P3 mentioned that while teachers did not face significant difficulties, the lack of teaching aids at school sometimes forced her to assign homework requiring internet access, which students could better utilize at home. P4 added that the diverse characteristics of students in different areas (coastal, suburban, urban) presented a challenge in



selecting and effectively using the textbooks, as the materials might not always align with the specific needs and backgrounds of all students.

Furthermore, the researcher has interviewed students as the ones who uses textbook that become the center of the learning. The result of students' interview is presented as follows:

Types of Books Used in Class

All three student participants mentioned that their teachers use two types of textbooks in the English teaching-learning process: government-issued textbooks and those provided by private-sector publishers. P5 stated, "There are two types of books, there are textbooks and Private-sector Publisher's books. My teacher always used Private-sector Publisher's book when learning." P6 and P7 echoed this, noting the frequent use of the private-sector publisher's book due to its abundance of questions and readings.

Frequency of Textbook Usage

The students agreed that textbooks provided by private-sector publishers are used very often in their English lessons. P5 mentioned, "Very often, every English lesson." P6 supported this, saying, "Often, every English lesson always discusses the Private-sector Publisher's book, which means twice a week." P7 also confirmed this frequent use, emphasizing the regular integration of these books into their classes.

Understanding the Content

The students generally found the content of the private-sector textbooks easy to understand, though some challenges were noted. P5 said, "It is easy. Because the teacher's explanation is easy to understand. But there are also some parts that are not easy to understand, for example, the text is blurry." P6 added, "Yes, because the content is more concise and easier to enter the brain. Each material has an explanation, examples, and practice questions too." P7 highlighted those related stories within the textbooks made comprehension easier.

Challenges with the Textbook

Students faced various challenges with the textbooks. P5 found it difficult to complete homework without the teacher's explanation: "If there is homework without the teacher explaining it, I can't do it in class." P6 struggled with difficult vocabulary and blurry text quality: "The difficulty is that the vocabulary is too difficult, the quality is also blurry, it is difficult to understand if there are pictures." P7 mentioned issues with long stories that often are lack of coherence: "Actually, sometimes if the story is long, it often doesn't connect with each other, the vocabulary is not clear."

Teacher's Assistance

Teachers played a crucial role in helping students overcome these challenges. P5 noted, "The teacher overcomes difficulties in using the Private-sector Publisher's



book by helping to explain in detail. The teacher also explained the parts that are not understood, explained one by one, the text is also sometimes translated one by one.” P6 appreciated the detailed explanations and translations provided by her teacher. P7 mentioned that her teacher helped by translating and connecting disjointed stories, making them easier to understand. These efforts significantly aided students in grasping the material better, leading to improved learning outcomes.

A series of non-participant observation has been conducted on April 29-30th, May 1st, and May 6-8th. The observation was done one class at a time which resulted in a total of six sessions. In each class, observation was done twice to ensure consistency in the data collected. This required the researcher to return to the same classroom in two consecutive weeks.

During this period, P1 was observed teaching class 9G, P2 with class 7A, and P3 with class 8B. The purpose of observing each teacher twice was to identify patterns or consistency in their teaching sessions. The observation aimed to capture a detailed description of the classroom environment and each teacher’s signature teaching style to validate and support data obtained from the interviews. P2 and P3 exclusively used textbooks from private-sector publishers, sourcing both material and exercises from them for every English lesson. In contrast, P1 combined government-issued textbooks with those from private-sector publishers, using the former for material and pictures and the latter for exercise questions due to the differing content balance.

The observations revealed that private-sector publisher textbooks had interactive elements, such as pictures, links, and QR codes leading to audiovisual media. If students had access to mobile phones and the internet, they could scan the QR codes to access additional learning materials. For example, a QR code linked to a video explaining adverbs of frequency with real-life examples, which enhanced student understanding. Higher student engagement was observed in P2 and P3’s classes, with students actively participating and completing tasks on time. In contrast, P1’s classroom exhibited neutral student engagement, with some students showing signs of boredom and distraction, likely due to a more lecture-heavy approach and less student involvement.

Despite the textbook differences, each teacher maintained their signature teaching style. P1 began with trigger questions about the material before proceeding, P2 directly introduced the material, sometimes asking students to read aloud, and P3 had students take turns reading while translating and connecting the text. P1 and P2 used supplementary materials directly from the private-sector publisher’s textbook, while P3 sourced additional materials from the internet, such as an audio clip from a website for narrative text. This added variety to the classroom materials, enriching the learning experience beyond the textbook.



Discussion

This research explores the perceptions of students in the English Education department regarding the importance of mastering public speaking skills for pre-service teachers, focusing on the academic year 2019/2020. The study aims to understand how these skills contribute to professional success and identify challenges students face in their development. Theoretically, data was based on the results of observations and questionnaires. In this discussion, the researcher analyses the critical points of the findings based on the research questions. Therefore, the researcher chose three points that were very critical for the researcher to discuss.

Factors Contributing to English Teachers' Preference towards Textbook from Private-sector Publisher

In a classroom, a complete textbook is essential for facilitating quality learning, and it should encompass clear content, well-written exercises, and easily understandable information that aligns with the course syllabus and educational guidelines, such as those set by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC). The preference for textbooks from private-sector publishers among teachers is attributed to their comprehensive guidelines, detailed syllabus, and lesson plans (RPP), which provide a structured framework for effective teaching. Additionally, these textbooks often feature QR codes linking to digital content, enhancing the learning experience. For instance, in Excerpt 4, P2 explains that the English Teacher Forum (MGMP) favors these textbooks for their completeness, including guidelines and QR features. Similarly, in Excerpt 5, P3 appreciates the comprehensive nature of private-sector publisher textbooks, which include questions, texts, images, and exercises for both midterm and final tests, offering more context and support than MoEC's textbooks. These excerpts underscore that the completeness and comprehensiveness of a textbook significantly influence teachers' preferences, aligning with Oakes & Saunders (2002), who emphasize content comprehensiveness as a marker of a quality textbook.

Balanced content in a textbook refers to the equal distribution and integration of the four language skills: listening, speaking, reading, and writing. In Excerpt 6, P2 confirms that the textbook from the private-sector publisher provides a comprehensive balance of activities needed for learning English, covering all four aspects. Similarly, in Excerpt 7, P3 affirms that the textbook includes a balanced approach, with sections dedicated to different language skills, such as listening activities segmented into multiple tasks. These excerpts underscore the importance of balanced and structured content in textbooks, which aids students in achieving proficiency across all language skills. This finding aligns with Fan, Lianghuo, and Kaeley's (2011) research, which highlights that textbook structure significantly influences teachers' preferences in selecting textbooks, a trend observed both in western contexts like Chicago and in Indonesia.



One significant factor influencing teachers' preference for selecting textbooks is their up-to-dateness with the current curriculum. As highlighted in Excerpt 8, P1 explains that private-sector publishers continuously update their materials to align with curriculum changes, such as the shift from the 2013 curriculum (Kurtilas) to the Merdeka curriculum. This responsiveness ensures that the textbook content remains relevant for students. Similarly, in Excerpt 9, P3 confirms that their school consistently uses textbooks from this private-sector publisher because they are always updated to reflect curriculum changes. This consistency makes the textbooks reliable and relevant, aligning with Rosyida's (2016) assertion that textbooks adhering closely to the learning plan and syllabus are more preferable. The private-sector publisher's commitment to staying current with curriculum adjustments ensures that their textbooks automatically suit the learning plan and syllabus, which also refer to the applied curriculum.

In Tegal city, where students come from diverse backgrounds such as laborers, pedicab drivers, and fishermen, selecting a textbook that resonates with these varied needs is crucial. As highlighted in Excerpt 10, the MGMP (Musyawarah Guru Mata Pelajaran) chose a private-sector publisher's textbook for its suitability in reflecting local students' needs. This decision was further supported by Excerpt 11, which notes that the practice questions were considered highly suitable for Tegal city's students, aligning with their characteristics and educational needs. Additionally, Excerpt 12 emphasizes that the vocabulary used in the textbook was intentionally chosen to match the students' levels, ensuring accessibility and comprehension. These considerations reflect Wen Cheng et al. (2011) who argue that the suitability of material to students' characteristics is a significant factor in textbook selection, promoting a more effective and inclusive learning environment.

Affordability is a key factor in textbook selection, especially in Tegal city, where students come from diverse socioeconomic backgrounds. As highlighted in Excerpt 14, teachers prioritize textbooks that are both affordable and comprehensive, ensuring that all students can access necessary educational resources without financial strain. The chosen private-sector publisher offers textbooks that are reasonably priced compared to more expensive alternatives, making them accessible to families with varying budgets. Excerpt 15 further emphasizes this point, as P3 explains that despite recommendations from MGMP to consider other publishers, their school remained loyal to the affordable textbook from the private-sector publisher, which is well-suited to the economically disadvantaged students in their community. This focus on affordability aligns with Nicol & Crespo's (2006) finding that access to resources influences teachers' preferences in textbook selection, demonstrating that affordability is a significant factor across different educational contexts.

The visual appeal of a textbook is crucial in engaging students and enhancing their learning experience. As noted in Excerpt 20, P2 highlights that the inclusion



of pictures in the textbook significantly boosts students' interest and makes the content more accessible. Modern students, who are often more visually oriented, find textbooks with vibrant images and clear, readable fonts more inviting and less intimidating. This visual engagement helps students easily grasp and memorize content, such as dialogues and stories. This aligns with Grammatosi & Harwood's (2014) finding that teachers' textbook selection decisions are influenced by how well the textbook meets students' interests and needs, underscoring the importance of visual appeal in fostering a more engaging learning environment.

Teachers' Perception towards The Use of Private-sector Publisher's Textbook

Teachers' perceptions of textbooks provided by private-sector publishers are significantly influenced by their ability to immediately engage students in the learning process. As highlighted in Excerpt 27, P3 emphasizes the textbook's crucial role in facilitating prompt student engagement. With a readily available textbook, students can quickly access reading materials, translate text when needed and start working on questions and exercises, without the time-consuming task of copying materials from the blackboard or slides. This immediate access enhances students' productivity and engagement, making the textbook a valuable tool in the classroom. This aligns with Alhamlan's (2013) findings that private-sector publisher's textbooks are seen as more engaging and interactive compared to government textbooks, as they enable students to focus directly on tasks rather than spending time transcribing information. Consequently, teachers favor these textbooks for their efficiency and their ability to foster active student participation.

Challenges in Using Private-sector Publisher's Textbook

A significant challenge with private-sector publisher's textbooks is their advanced vocabulary, which can hinder student comprehension and engagement. As noted in Excerpts 32 and 33, the complex and evolving vocabulary often requires teachers to consult dictionaries and manage content carefully, especially with scientific terms. This makes teaching more challenging and slows down students' understanding. Student P7 also highlighted that the difficult vocabulary serves as a major barrier, impacting their ability to grasp concepts and succeed academically. This aligns with Sweller and Chandler's (1991) finding that information presentation mismatched to students' cognitive abilities leads to poorer understanding and learning outcomes. Thus, advanced vocabulary in these textbooks poses a significant challenge for effective teaching.

Local content is crucial in textbooks as it relates to the physical, social, and cultural environment, enhancing relevance and engagement for students. Excerpt 35 highlights the lack of local context in private-sector textbooks compared to government ones. P2 points out that while private-sector textbooks offer more up-to-date content, they still fail to address local contexts, making it challenging for students to relate to the material. Pinar (2004) emphasizes that textbooks need to



align with students' cultural backgrounds to maintain engagement. The absence of local content means students struggle to connect with the material, underscoring the need for textbooks to incorporate local context to enhance their effectiveness in the teaching and learning process.

Teachers also face significant challenges due to infrastructure and resource limitations when using textbooks from private-sector publishers. Excerpt 36 discusses the inadequate school facilities, such as broken LCDs, which hinder the integration of multimedia materials into lessons. Excerpt 37 highlights the lack of teaching aids and restricted internet access at school, forcing teachers to rely on students' home internet for assignments. Excerpt 38 further explains how the lack of facilities affects the implementation of balanced learning activities, such as listening exercises, which often need to be simplified due to inadequate resources. Sweller and Chandler (1991) suggest that such infrastructural limitations negatively impact students' learning experiences, making it crucial to address these challenges to effectively utilize the textbooks.

Conclusion and Suggestion

Conclusion

This study extensively explored the factors influencing teachers' preferences for private-sector textbooks, their perceptions of these textbooks, and the challenges faced by students and teachers. The findings emphasize the importance of content quality and variety, including practice questions and visual media, which enhance student interest and facilitate effective learning. Usability, readability, and supplementary materials such as teacher handbooks also play crucial roles in teachers' textbook preferences.

Teachers generally view private-sector textbooks positively, appreciating their content quality, practical utility, and academic support. However, challenges such as language and content complexity, including advanced vocabulary and scientific terms, require additional teacher support. The lack of local context in textbooks and infrastructural limitations, such as broken LCDs and insufficient teaching aids, further complicate the effective use of these resources.

The study contributes valuable insights into textbook selection and utilization, highlighting the need for textbooks that are complete, engaging, and adaptable to various teaching and learning environments. It underscores the importance of addressing students' and teachers' needs in textbook development to enhance English language teaching, particularly in Indonesia. This research provides a foundation for future improvements in textbook content and usability, aiming for more effective English education.



Suggestion

Based on the research findings, several suggestions can be made. Textbook publishers should include more local content to make learning more relevant and relatable for students. They should also balance the use of advanced vocabulary with simpler explanations and glossaries to ease the teaching and learning process.

Teachers are encouraged to stay updated with educational and technological advancements. Adapting to new technologies can be challenging, especially for more experienced educators, but seeking assistance from younger colleagues can help them better utilize new resources.

The government should invest in improving school infrastructure and ensure timely textbook distribution. Proper maintenance of facilities and preparedness for curriculum changes will support effective teaching and learning.

Further research should examine the long-term impacts of private-sector textbooks on student outcomes, including academic performance and language skills. A quantitative approach could provide more objective data, complementing the qualitative insights from this study.

References

- Adams, A., & Cox, A. L. (2008). Questionnaires, in-depth interviews and focus groups. In P. & A. L. Cox (Eds.), *Research Methods for Human-Computer Interaction* (pp. 17–34). chapter, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. <https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/abs/research-methods-for-humancomputer-interaction/questionnaires-indepth-interviews-and-focus-groups/FA5B7278B9A5E489AFA83A030C816EB9>
- Adams, William C. Newcomer, K.E., Hatry, H. P. (2015). *Conducting Semi-Structured Interviews*. San Francisco: Wiley. Retrieved September 03, 2023, from <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/book/10.1002/9781119171386.ch19>
- Adi, T. (2016). Penggunaan Lks sebagai Tindakan Rasionalitas Guru dalam Proses Pembelajaran (Kajian Fenomenologi di SMA N 7 Surakarta Tahun Pelajaran 2015/2016). *SOSIALITAS; Jurnal Ilmiah Pend. Sos Ant*, 5(2). Retrieved September 03, 2023, from <https://media.neliti.com/media/publications/13816-ID-penggunaan-lks-sebagai-tindakan-rasionalitas-guru-dalam-proses-pembelajaran-kaji.pdf>
- Alhamlan, S. (2013). *EFL Curriculum and Needs Analysis: An Evaluative Study*. Online Submission. Retrieved June 09, 2024 from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED542860.pdf>
- Amiruddin, E. P., & Syafitri, N. (2023). The Perception of English Teachers Related to Textbook Provided by Government as A Primary Teaching Material. *English Education Journal*, 7(2), 73-80. <https://doi.org/10.55340/e2j.v7i2.691> (Original work published November



15, 2021) Retrieved June 09, 2024 from
<https://www.ejournal.lppmunidayan.ac.id/index.php/english/article/view/691/533>

Aulia, G. (2021). The Construction of Student Worksheets: Material, Pattern, and Systematics. *ISLLAC: Journal of Intensive Studies on Language, Literature, Art, and Culture*, 5(1), 9-101.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.17977/um006v5i12021p94-101> Retrieved September 03, 2023 from

<https://journal2.um.ac.id/index.php/jisllac/article/view/19074/7266>

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.

<https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa> Retrieved September 02, 2023, from

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/ref/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa?scroll=top>

Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Mixed Methods Procedures. Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (5th Ed.). Los Angeles: Sage Publication. Retrieved September 03, 2023, from https://spada.uns.ac.id/pluginfile.php/510378/mod_resource/content/1/creswell.pdf

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2016). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. California: Sage Publications. Retrieved from [https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=en&lr=&id=DLbBDQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Creswell,+J.+W.,+%26+Poth,+C.+N.+\(2016\).+Qualitative+Inquiry+and+Research+Design:+Choosing+Among+Five+Approaches.+California:+Sage+Publications.+&ots=ip18fMUSx&sig=0A1K3PLQOF8q0PB8rE9y2y4Weww&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Creswell%2C%20J.%20W.%2C%20%26%20Poth%2C%20C.%20N.%20\(2016\).%20Qualitative%20Inquiry%20and%20Research%20Design%3A%20Choosing%20Among%20Five%20Approaches.%20California%3A%20Sage%20Publications.&f=false](https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=en&lr=&id=DLbBDQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Creswell,+J.+W.,+%26+Poth,+C.+N.+(2016).+Qualitative+Inquiry+and+Research+Design:+Choosing+Among+Five+Approaches.+California:+Sage+Publications.+&ots=ip18fMUSx&sig=0A1K3PLQOF8q0PB8rE9y2y4Weww&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Creswell%2C%20J.%20W.%2C%20%26%20Poth%2C%20C.%20N.%20(2016).%20Qualitative%20Inquiry%20and%20Research%20Design%3A%20Choosing%20Among%20Five%20Approaches.%20California%3A%20Sage%20Publications.&f=false)

Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing Your Coursebook*. Oxford: Heineman.

Retrieved September 02, 2023, from

https://www.academia.edu/36192204/Choosing_your_coursebook_alan_cunningsworth

Desnatalia, I., Made Arnawa, I., & Irwan, I. (2018). Development of student's work sheet based on contextual approach of the sequence and series material. *Proceedings of the International Conferences on Educational, Social Sciences and Technology (ICESST) 2018*, 2(1), 650–656.

Retrieved September 15, 2023, from <https://doi.org/10.29210/2018196>



- Dorsten, L. E. (2019). Nonparticipant Observation. *Interpreting Social and Behavioral Research*, 59–62. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315266367-11> Retrieved September 15, 2023 from <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/mono/10.4324/9781315266367-11/nonparticipant-observation-linda-eberst-dorsten?context=ubx&refId=a64bc4a3-54d5-4bdf-9413-a4ab40ae0274>
- Dhydo, M. H. (2022). Indonesian EFL Learners' reasons and Benefits of Joining Zoom English Café Online Speaking Club. Thesis, Universitas Jambi. Retrieved January, 29, 2023 from <https://repository.unja.ac.id/34216/>
- Fan, Lianghuo and Kaeley, Gurcharn S. (2000) "The Influence of Textbooks on Teaching Strategies: An Empirical Study," *Mid-Western Educational Researcher*: Vol. 13: Iss. 4, Article 2. Available at: <https://scholarworks.bgsu.edu/mwer/vol13/iss4/2>
- Flick, U. (2010). *An Introduction to Qualitative (4th Ed.)* London: SAGE Publications Ltd. Retrieved September 23, 2023, from https://elearning.shisu.edu.cn/pluginfile.php/35310/mod_resource/content/2/Research-Intro-Flick.pdf
- Formby, S. K., Medlin, D., & Ellington, V. B. (2017). Microsoft Excel®: is it an important job skill for college graduates?. *Information Systems Education Journal*, 15(3), 55-63 Retrieved December 13, 2023, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1140801.pdf>
- Gay, G. (2010). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice*. New York: Teachers' College Press. Retrieved on May 30, 2024 from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED581130>
- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. W. (2012). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications*. Hoboken, NJ: Pearson. Retrieved November 11, 2023, from https://yuli-elearning.com/pluginfile.php/4831/mod_resource/content/1/Gay-E%20Book%20Educational%20Research-2012.pdf
- Grady, C. (2015). Enduring and emerging challenges of informed consent. *The New England Journal of Medicine*, 372(9), 855-862. <https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMra1411250> Retrieved June 08, 2024 from <https://www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMra1411250>
- Grammatosi, F., & Harwood, N. (2014). An Experienced Teacher's Use of the Textbook on an Academic English Course: A Case Study. *English Language Teaching Textbooks*, 178–204. Retrieved October 20, 2023, from https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1057/9781137276285_6#citeas
- Graves, M., & Graves, B. (2019). *Designing effective textbooks: A guide for authors and educators*. New York, NY: Routledge. Retrieved June 5th, 2024 from <https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=0VqGDwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR11&dq=Designing+effective+textbooks:+>



A+guide+for+authors+and+educators.&ots=OMHIQQuzjW&sig=nJg
cezQ4P6Mts9RIZeG5GLLtNvM

Guest, G., MacQueen, K., & Namey, E. (2014). *Introduction to Applied Thematic Analysis*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications Inc. Retrieved September 13, 2023 from https://antle.iat.sfu.ca/wp-content/uploads/Guest_2012_AppliedThematicAnlaysia_Ch1.pdf

Hartatik, S. F. (2017). Authentic, Adopted Or Adapted Material: Teacher Preference On Selecting Teaching Material In Speaking Class. *ELT in Asia in the Digital Era: Global Citizenship and Identity*, 361. Retrieved April 04, 2024 from https://www.academia.edu/download/60708092/PROCEEDINGS_ASIA_TEFLL_201720190925-20210-g7aez8.pdf#page=375

Jannah, R. (2019). *Teachers' Perception on The Use of English Textbook In Teaching English*. Thesis, Universitas Islam Negeri ArRaniry), 1(1). Retrieved September 12, 2023, from <https://repository.ar-raniry.ac.id/id/eprint/7050/1/RAUDHATUL%20JANNAH%20%28140203085%29%20SKRIPSI%20FULL.pdf>

Kini, T. & Podolsky, A. (2016). *Does Teaching Experience Increase Teacher Effectiveness? A Review of the Research* (research brief). Palo Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute. <https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/product/brief-does-teaching-experience-increase-teacher-effectiveness-review-research>

Kodriyah, L., Islamiah, N., & Aprizani, Y. (2020). English teachers' preferences in using instructional materials for senior high school students in Indonesia. In *Proceedings of the Borneo International Conference on Education and Social Sciences (BICESS 2018)* (pp. 263-267). Retrieved April 04, 2024 from <https://www.scitepress.org/Papers/2018/90196/90196.pdf>

Leavy, P. (2014). *The Oxford Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press. Retrieved October 10, 2023, from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199811755.001.0001>

Lindsay, P. H., & Norman, D. A. (1977). *Human information processing: An introduction to psychology* (2nd ed.). Academic Press. Retrieved June 09, 2024 from [https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=en&lr=&id=_shGBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Lindsay,+P.+H.,+%26+Norman,+D.+A.+%281977%29.+Human+information+processing:+An+introduction+to+psychology+\(2nd+ed.\).+Academic+Press.&ots=Ix5HarFttX&sig=fhu_EWqFXobCDtKzgMn0VLMU9tQ&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false](https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=en&lr=&id=_shGBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Lindsay,+P.+H.,+%26+Norman,+D.+A.+%281977%29.+Human+information+processing:+An+introduction+to+psychology+(2nd+ed.).+Academic+Press.&ots=Ix5HarFttX&sig=fhu_EWqFXobCDtKzgMn0VLMU9tQ&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q&f=false)

Littlejohn, A. (2023). The Analysis of Language Teaching Materials: Inside The Trojan Horse. *Materials Development in Language Teaching*, 179–211. Retrieved September 13, 2023, from

<http://doi.org/10.1017/9781139042789.011>



- Martin, T. L., Yu, C. T., Martin, G. L., & Fazzio, D. (2006). On choice, preference, and preference for choice. *The Behavior Analyst Today*, 7(2), 234–241. Retrieved October 10, 2023 from <https://doi.org/10.1037/h0100083>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*. California: Sage Publications. Retrieved from https://www.academia.edu/download/43491723/Miles_Huberman_Data_analysis.pdf
- Mohammadi, M., & Abdi, H. (2014). Textbook Evaluation: A Case Study. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 98(1994), 1148–1155. Retrieved September 11, 2023, from <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.03.528>
- Mukundan, J., Nimehchisalem, V., & Hajimohammadi, R. (2011). Developing an English language textbook evaluation checklist. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 1(6), 173-179. <https://doi.org/10.19030/cier.v4i6.4383> Retrieved June 11th, 2024 from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1072790>
- Nguyen, C. . (2015). *An Evaluation of the Textbook English 6 : A case study from secondary schools in the Mekong Delta Provinces of Vietnam* by Cang Trung Nguyen Department of English Language and Linguistics. University of Sheffield, 1–304. Retrieved October 10, 2023 from <https://etheses.whiterose.ac.uk/10033/>
- Nicol, C. C., & Crespo, S. M. (2006). Learning to teach with mathematics textbooks: How preservice teachers interpret and use curriculum materials. *Educational studies in mathematics*, 62, 331-355. Retrieved October 2023, from <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10649-006-5423-y>
- Oakes, J., & Saunders, M. (2002). Access to textbooks, instructional materials, equipment, and technology: Inadequacy and inequality in California's public schools. UCLA's Institute for Democracy, Education, and Access. Retrieved June 4th, 2024 from <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4ht4z71v>
- Ose, S. O. (2016). Using Excel and Word to structure qualitative data. *Journal of Applied Social Science*, 10(2), 147-162. Retrieved December 13, 2023 from <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1936724416664948>
- Patton, M. Q. (1999). Enhancing the quality and credibility of qualitative analysis. *Health Services Research*, 34(5 Pt 2), 1189–1208. Retrieved September 12, 2023 from <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/10591279> <http://www.pubmedcentral.nih.gov/articlerender.fcgi?artid=PMC1089059>



- Pinar, W. (2014). *Curriculum: Toward new identities*. Routledge.
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315051604> Retrieved May 30th, 2024 from
<https://api.taylorfrancis.com/content/books/mono/download?identifierName=doi&identifierValue=10.4324/9781315051604&type=googlepdf>
- Putri, A. T. S. (2023). *Persepsi Siswa Terhadap Penggunaan Lks Sebagai Bantu Pada Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris Di Kelas VIII SMP (Students' Perception Towards Using Worksheet As Helping Tools In Learning English At Class VIII Of The Junior High School)*. *Educurio: Education Curiosity*, 1(2), 553–556. Retrieved September 05, 2023, from
<https://qjurnal.my.id/index.php/educurio/article/download/323/246>
- Richards, J. (2015). *The Role of Textbooks in a Language Program The Role of Textbooks in a Language Program*. California: Sage Publications.
Retrieved October 10, 2023, from <https://www.professorjackrichards.com/wp-content/uploads/role-of-textbooks.pdf>
- Roberts, F., Aziz, A. A., & Matore, M. E. E. M. (2020). *Criteria of a Good ELT Textbook: Malaysian Teachers' Perception*. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 8(12A), 7433–7442. Retrieved September 12, 2023, from <https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2020.082527>
- Rosyida, E. (2016). *Teachers' Perception Toward The Use of English Textbook*. *English Education: Jurnal Tadris Bahasa Inggris*, 9(1), 43–54. Retrieved September 11, 2023, from <https://ejournal.radenintan.ac.id/index.php/ENGEDU>
- Samimi, P., & Tabatabaei, N. (2022). *Preschool children's indoor and outdoor playground HSV color preferences*. *Color Research & Application*, 47(3), 745-757. Retrieved December 07, 2023, from
<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/col.22759>
- Saunders, B., Kitzinger, J., & Kitzinger, C. (2015). *Anonymising interview data: Challenges and compromise in practice*. *Qualitative research*, 15(5), 616-632. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794114550439> Retrieved June 09, 2024 from <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1468794114550439>
- Sheldon, L. E. (1988). *Evaluating ELT textbooks and materials*. *ELT Journal*, 42(4), 237-246. <https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/42.4.237> Retrieved June 11th, 2024 from <https://academic.oup.com/eltj/article-abstract/42/4/237/484443>
- Sternberg, R. J., & Sternberg, K. (2012). *Cognitive psychology (6th ed.)*. Cengage Learning. Retrieved June 09, 2024 from
https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Mohammad_Khakshour2/publication/282182477_cognitive_psychology_eduction_6/links/5606409308ae5e8e3f33705f.pdf
- Susanti, D. (2017). *Praktikalitas Lembar Kerja Siswa (LKS) Berbasis Pendekatan Learning Cycle 5-Emateri Sistem Organisasi Kehidupan*. *Jurnal*



Bioconcetta, 3(1), 14–20. Retrieved September 13, 2023
<https://doi.org/10.22202/bc.2017.v3i1.2722>

Sweller, J., & Chandler, P. (1991). Evidence for Cognitive Load Theory. *Cognition and Instruction*, 8(4), 351–362.
https://doi.org/10.1207/s1532690xci0804_5 Retrieved May 20th, 2024
from https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1207/s1532690xci0804_5

Tomlinson, B. (2012). Materials development for language learning and teaching. *Language Teaching*, 45(2), 143-179. Retrieved June 09, 2024 from
<https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/language-teaching/article/abs/materials-developmentfor-language-learning-and-teaching/AB9B247D6CDA981F0E3BD8FC3DBE36>

Vural, Ö. F., & Başaran, M. (2021). The reasons for teachers' preference for Master's degree: Teachers' preference for Master's degree. *International Journal of Curriculum and Instruction*, 13(1), 589-613. Retrieved April 1, 2024, from <https://ijci.globets.org/index.php/IJCI/article/view/533>

Weih, T. G. (2014). Revealing relationships: First graders share personal literature. *Sage Open*, 4(2). Retrieved September 12, 2023, from
<https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244014529438>

Weih, T. G. (2015). How to Select Books for Teaching to Children: Taking a Critical Look at Books Through a Pedagogical Lens. University of Northern Iowa, 1–20. Retrieved September 12, 2023, from
<https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED554313.pdf>

Wen-Cheng, W., Chien-Hung, L., & Chung-Chieh, L. (2011). Thinking of the textbook in the ESL/EFL classroom. *English Language Teaching*, 4(2), 91-96. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v4n2p91> Retrieved on June 4th, 2024
from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1080671>

Wilson, K. (2019). *Essential Office 365 Third Edition: The Illustrated Guide to Using Microsoft Office*. Elluminet press. Retrieved December 11, 2023
from https://www.academia.edu/71002335/Essential_Office_365_Third_Edition_The_Illustrated_Guide_to_Using_Microsoft_Office