

“Greening” the National Growth: How Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI) Collaborates with Indonesia in 2014-2020

Novita Putri Rudiany

Center for ASEAN Research on Energy (CARE), Department of International Relations,
Universitas Pertamina

E-mail: novita.putri@universitaspertamina.ac.id

Keista Puti Yesandi

Department of International Relations, Universitas Pertamina

E-mail: keistaputi@gmail.com

Abstract

With its natural richness, Indonesia is not immune from environmental, economic, and social problems. Indonesia remains facing the problem of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions and environmental degradation resulting from economic activities caused by business-as-usual (BaU) activities. Therefore, Indonesia has developed a framework for a green growth program for national economic development with the Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI) since 2014. GGGI is an international organization that is specifically concerned about green growth at the global level. The Green Growth Concept was agreed upon at the 2005 Asia Pacific ministerial meetings in Seoul, South Korea. Indonesia also ratified the agreements to implement this green growth concept at the national level. This research elaborates on how GGGI, as a global actor, collaborates with Indonesia to develop the green growth framework. This study uses a descriptive qualitative research method with secondary data collection through literature, which will discuss GGGI's efforts to help implement the green growth program in Indonesia in 2014-2020. The case study is analyzed through the Management Approach, Normative Approach, and Enforcement Approach approaches. Through these three approaches, GGGI has succeeded in assisting Indonesia in implementing green growth in Indonesia in 2014-2020. Some of the programs that have been achieved include the eCBA program, the development of Special Economic Zones (KEK), and the implementation of the legal regulations in force in Indonesia.

Keywords: enforcement approach, Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI), Green Growth program, management approach, normative approach

Abstrak

Dengan kekayaan alamnya, Indonesia rupanya tidak luput dari permasalahan lingkungan, ekonomi, dan sosial. Indonesia masih menghadapi permasalahan emisi gas rumah kaca (GRK) dan degradasi lingkungan akibat aktivitas ekonomi yang disebabkan oleh aktivitas business-as-usual (BaU). Oleh karena itu, Indonesia telah menyusun kerangka program pertumbuhan hijau untuk pembangunan ekonomi nasional bersama Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI) sejak tahun 2014. GGGI merupakan organisasi internasional yang secara khusus memiliki kepedulian terhadap pertumbuhan hijau di tingkat global. Konsep Pertumbuhan Hijau muncul dan disepakati pada pertemuan tingkat menteri Asia Pasifik tahun 2005 di Seoul, Korea Selatan. Indonesia juga meratifikasi perjanjian untuk menerapkan konsep pertumbuhan hijau ini di tingkat nasional. Penelitian ini mengelaborasi bagaimana GGGI sebagai aktor global berkolaborasi dengan Indonesia untuk mengembangkan kerangka pertumbuhan hijau. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode penelitian deskriptif kualitatif dengan

pengumpulan data sekunder melalui literatur, yang akan membahas tentang upaya GGGI membantu implementasi program pertumbuhan hijau di Indonesia pada tahun 2014-2020. Studi ini dilakukan melalui pendekatan teoritis, yakni: Pendekatan Manajemen, Pendekatan Normatif, dan Pendekatan secara Paksaan. Melalui ketiga pendekatan tersebut, GGGI berhasil membantu Indonesia dalam menerapkan pertumbuhan hijau di Indonesia pada tahun 2014-2020. Beberapa program yang telah dicapai antara lain program eCBA, pengembangan Kawasan Ekonomi Khusus (KEK), dan penerapan peraturan hukum yang berlaku di Indonesia.

Kata kunci: *enforcement approach, Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI), Green Growth program, management approach, normative approach*

INTRODUCTION

Even though the government has ratified the agreement related to the implementation of the green growth concept based on the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UNESCAP) Ministerial Meeting in 2005, Indonesia still has problems at the national level. A green growth program is a new development policy that focuses on the sustainable use of natural resources to minimize the negative impacts of business-as-usual (BAU) economic development. The development of green growth is not a substitute for sustainable development but rather to achieve sustainable development itself (Kasztelan, 2017). The green growth policies specifically discuss how to solve ecological and economic problems by creating new environmentally based growth schemes, namely by creating green markets through green technology and green jobs (O'Donnell, 2012). At least three significant challenges for Indonesia in implementing the green growth program: a response to climate change, green jobs, and sustainable development. Therefore, the government of Indonesia collaborates with global actors to develop national green growth programs, one of which is the Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI).

In 2010, Korean President Lee Myung-Bak initiated an international organization that discusses green growth policies, namely the Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI). Then, GGGI was finally formalized as an International Organization based on the Rio+ Summit in 2012 (GGGI, 2022). GGGI aims to support member countries and their partners to maintain international commitments in achieving sustainable development goals formed through green growth development program policies. The central vision of green growth is to reduce the amount of low carbon in developing countries, while the mission of GGGI is to create a model scheme for economic growth in new and emerging developing countries known as green growth, which then gradually targets economic growth, the creation of green jobs, involvement social security, resource security and poverty reduction (GGGI, 2015). The GGGI mission received support from Indonesia, Australia, Cambodia, Denmark, Costa Rica, Ethiopia, Kiribati, the Republic of Korea, Mexico, Norway, Papua New Guinea, Paraguay, Qatar, Rwanda, United Arab Emirates, England, Vietnam, Thailand, Mongolia, Japan, Jordan, and Germany which are member countries.

In connection with the development of green growth policies in Indonesia, specifically in response to climate

change, in 2012 primary energy supply in Indonesia was still dominated by fossil energy such as oil, coal, and gas, as much as 20.6%. Meanwhile, the supply of New Renewable Energy (NRE), such as geothermal, water, and other biofuels, only makes up 5% of the total. Considering that fossil energy reserves are increasingly limited, which, compared with oil reserves, are only around 0.20%, gas at 1.60%, and coal at 1.10%, it is necessary to optimize the reduction of brown growth in Indonesia (Sugiyono et al., 2014). This condition causes ecological problems such as environmental deforestation and climate change. On the one hand, environmental deforestation activities affect the change in function and the allotment of forest areas to achieve development targets. Forest degradation can lead to community conflicts, and wrong management can eliminate animal habitats and damage biodiversity. Based on the World Resources Institute Climate Analysis Indicator Tool (WRI-CAIT) results in 2013, Indonesia is said to have contributed 65.5% of glass gas emissions. If you look at the world total, Indonesia is ranked 6th as the country producing Southeast Asia's largest greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions.

On the other hand, Indonesia also faces -especially in the southern region- a rise in sea levels, with at least 23 million Indonesians being directly affected, for example, in Gundul Island and Betet Island in South Sumatra, where the Banyuasin Regency area is recently sinking. Unfortunately, Indonesia's climate policy is still based on the NDC documents, and the 2020-2024 National Medium Term Development Plan (Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Meneng-

ah/RPJMN) still lacks stakeholders coordination to provide real action or mitigation plan. In addition, climate policy in Indonesia also pays little attention to aspects of loss and damage or loss and damage from the impacts caused (GGGI, 2021).

The second problem for Indonesia while formulating the green growth program is the availability of green jobs. An essential pillar for realizing green growth is sustainable industrial management, commonly known as the green industry (Saepudin et al., 2020). In order to strengthen its commitment to green industrial development, the Indonesian Government has included aspects of green industry in eleven draft priorities of the (RPJMN). Indonesia's commitment to realizing a green industry is influenced by several international regimes, such as the 1997 Kyoto Protocol, one of the amendments related to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) regarding efforts to deal with global warming. However, the employment rate in this sector is low due to a lack of human resources capacities and capabilities in green industries.

Last but not least, sustainable development has also become the government challenge to address in realizing the green growth program. Indonesia has been ambitious in adopting sustainable development principles to its national and local policies. One of its implementation is in Kalimantan. Rapid economic development in the Kalimantan region destroys natural resources such as forests, peatlands, and environmental services. In this case, the green economy approach is considered a solution for Central Kalimantan Province

to realize a balance of capital aspects to develop the economy. With green economic policies through the REDD+ program, it can produce outputs using natural resources wisely, protecting habitats and carbon stocks (Azhari, 2020). The Indonesian government collaborated with European countries to directly ensure sustainable development in the local area. However, this kind of collaboration shall be expanded to ensure the realization of sustainable development principles. Therefore, engagement with the GGGI will help Indonesia to catch up with its international commitment to realizing the green growth program.

In short, a high rate of GHGs triggers climate change, which can affect environmental problems and disrupt social activities, especially as Indonesia is one of the countries that contributes more than 50% of total greenhouse gas emissions. This condition then became one of the drivers for the emergence of a green growth strategy as an alternative strategy for a country's national policy. Indonesia has ambition to The existence of green growth programs adopted by countries worldwide, including Indonesia, provides policy solutions to these problems through international organizations such as GGGI, which can support member countries to maintain commitments and achieve green development goals. Indonesia cooperates with GGGI and supports strong and inclusive economic growth. From the previous explanation, this research aims to elaborate on how GGGI collaborates with the Indonesian government in implementing the Green Growth Program in 2014-2020. This article comprises five parts: introduction,

conceptual frameworks, research methods, results and discussion, and conclusion. The research uses three approaches of the International Organization programs implementation.

Theories or Conceptual Framework: International Organization Programs Implementation

One of the functions of international organizations is to provide a forum for cooperation in overcoming common issues at the international level. Within international organizations, countries' leaders can discuss and formulate norms that benefit member countries. Therefore, it has a significant role in influencing a member country's policies. Many International Relations scholars have discussed the study of the implementation of the role of international organizations because of the increase in international agreements and policies implementation within the national scope.

Three approaches can explain the program implementation by International Organizations: enforcement, management, and normative (Joachim et al., 2008: 8). First, the enforcement approach suggests implementation and compliance with international agreements that are ensured through coercive means. This approach seeks for international organizations to be able to influence and ensure implementation through coercive measures such as naming and shaming, namely the assessment of the basis of state reports, experts, inspections, or NGO reports, as well as sanctions, namely economic sanctions, military, financial penalties, and others. An international organization can conduct -at least- two methods in the

enforcement approach: monitoring and sanctioning. In ensuring that the states are committed to the international agreement, a committee consisting of international experts, will be sent to a specific member state to monitor and inspect the progress of implementation. The report from this committee will be the basis of judgment on whether the states are violating the commitments or not. So that, the organization can impose sanctions if it is necessary. By enforcing rules, compliance can increase, especially with sanctions for the state if it violates it (GGGI, 2022).

Second, the management approach focuses on how international organizations monitor the state reports, experts, inspections, and capacity building and problem-solving through expert input, interpretation of regulations, finance, or state institutions (Joachim et al., 2008: 9). Monitoring state is a monitoring process carried out on a country as it is expected to provide regular progress reports on their activities at the international level to the organization overseeing the implementation process. In understanding capacity building, international organizations can play an essential role in policy implementation because they can help countries develop the capacity to take the necessary steps. In this case, international organizations have particular expertise to provide technical assistance to the country concerned. In addition, the organization can also offer financial assistance to the state to help with policy implementation.

The third approach is the normative approach, which emphasizes the legitimacy and rule of law governing one specific issue. In its implementation,

international organizations act according to the country's rules so that there is no coercion and authority on the state. Authority and legitimacy are significant to international organizations because law enforcement needs to be carried out by the goals to be achieved in the country. Since World War II, the international organization authorities have used their instruments to ask member countries to comply with international rules and to demand sanctions against countries if they violate them (Joachim et al., 2008: 9). In analyzing the implementation of green growth programs in Indonesia, we use the three management, normative, and enforcement approaches to see how GGGI helps Indonesia achieve its green growth target.

Research Methods

This research is an analytical descriptive study using qualitative methods. Descriptive research aims to describe the problem variables. This article explains how Indonesia plans to develop a green growth program to achieve its national target and fulfill its international commitment, especially regarding GHG emission reduction. In this case, GGGI collaborates with the Indonesian government to expand the green growth program. We used enforcement, management, and normative approaches to explain how GGGI, as an international organization, can penetrate the green growth principles of Indonesia. Therefore, the qualitative method fits this research, focusing on explaining the situation in detail.

Supporting the research aims, we are collecting data in terms of internet-based and literature-based. The data that we used ranged from primary and

secondary data. The primary data the authors use is official information in the form of annual reports, and results achievement reports issued by the Government or International Organizations. In contrast, secondary data is retyped data based on primary data. Keeping the issue current, we limited our literature sources within the last ten years of publication. Meanwhile, we kept looking at the older publications to understand the theoretical framework so we could explain the relations between research objects. Using the internet, we looked at the supporting data with keywords such as Global Green Growth Institute, green growth program, sustainable development, international organization, and international program implementation. In addition to the literature-based data, we focused on the previous research regarding international organizations and their relations with the member states.

We also focus on the period of 2014 to 2020 in this research. In 2014, the Indonesian government officially signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with GGGI after its kick-off discussion in 2012. In 2020, there was a signing ceremony of the Host Country Agreement (HCA) between the Republic of Indonesia and the Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI), which formalizes GGGI's presence in Indonesia, has been ratified through Presidential Regulation Number 78 of 2020 and signed by President Joko Widodo on July 16, 2020 (Bappenas, 2018a). From 2014-2020, Indonesia worked with GGGI to formulate the standard framework, which was finally launched in 2020 along with the new RPJMN 2020-2024 period. With this specific period, we aim to provide a

profound elaboration on how GGGI helps the Indonesian government to set the national policies regarding green growth and faces the three economic development challenges: the impacts of climate change, providing and increasing green jobs, and ensuring the national sustainable development.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This part focuses on how the Global Green Institute (GGGI) and the Government of Indonesia collaborate to set the enabling environment for the green growth program in Indonesia. This collaboration is analyzed using management, normative, and enforcement approaches. While both actors collaborate, GGGI also significantly penetrates the green growth concepts in Indonesia's national policies, which emphasize green policies, innovation, and investment are strengthened to achieve sustainable development. The three concepts will later show which approach is the most dominant applied by GGGI to realize the green growth program in Indonesia. The program designed by GGGI to implement Green Growth in Indonesia will be analyzed to see how the assistance and implementation efforts are.

Management Approach

First, the management approach is used by international organizations to monitor countries through capacity building and state monitoring. In this case, International Organizations monitor the implementation of their policies toward the country concerned. Later, these countries can provide regular progress reports on their activities at the international level to the

relevant international organizations. International organizations that supervise countries monitor countries to comply with international commitments. On one side, the context of capacity building in the management approach means assistance from international organizations to provide capacity to help countries implement international rules through the human resource development program and natural resources management.

The capacity building provided by GGGI to Indonesia covers regulating financial and technical assistance and interpreting the regulations accurately and orderly. Since the implementation of the collaborative Green Growth Program (GGP) between the Government of Indonesia and GGGI in Phase I in 2013, Indonesia has been trying to implement the GGP under the framework of the National Green Growth Roadmap 2015, which was later penetrated in the Mid-Term National Development Planning (Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah/RPJMN) 2020. This program has improved the financial reporting structure in a complete and accountable manner. In this case, GGGI succeeded in assisting Indonesia in developing a strategic plan for monitoring new and renewable energy projects in the Special Economic Zone/SEZ (Kawasan Ekonomi Khusus/KEK) in the Sei Mangkei region.

The development of SEZ is one of Indonesia's strategies for encouraging green growth-based investment, which is of particular concern to increase Indonesia's competitiveness. In this case, a policy is needed to determine the selection of regional locations that meet the SEZ development requirements (Sihaloho & Muna, 2010). The

establishment of SEZs in several regions in Indonesia is intended to provide benefits for Indonesia in terms of (1) employment absorption, (2) increasing state investment, (3) competitive advantage of export products, (4) state foreign exchange receipts, (5) encouraging an increase in the quality of human resources through technology transfer increasing the utilization of local resources, export-import capital services, and (6) increasing the utilization of local resources, export-import capital services. The goal of technology transfer aligns with the Indonesian government's vision to increase national equity in Indonesian territory, the economy, and national equity in Indonesian territory and create substantial economic fundamentals, both macro and micro (Sihaloho & Muna, 2010). In its implementation, several institutions in SEZ cooperate, including the central government, local government, business entities, national council, secretary general of the national council, regional council, and administrators. In this case, the central government supports SEZ in stipulating and providing incentives and security infrastructure at SEZ locations. The local government plays a role in building facilities and infrastructure outside the SEZ to give a *spill-over effect* on the society that lives close to the SEZ. Business entities are given the authority to carry out the management and development of SEZs. The National Council provides general policies and strategies in the formation and development of SEZs. Then, the National Council will review regional proposals and supervise and control SEZ operations.

The government and the GGGI determine five green growth principles for SEZ implementation. First, reducing greenhouse gas emissions that can cause climate change; second, namely environment, economy, and social resilience; third, sustainable economic growth; fourth, inclusive and equitable growth; and lastly, a healthy and productive environmental service provider ecosystem. To achieve these results, the Indonesian government has established programs related to green investment in KEK areas. GGGI conducted a green growth assessment using the Extended Cost Benefit Analysis (eCBA) method in the Sei Mangkei region in North Sumatra. This effort is made to identify investment opportunities that will later be developed into green projects to meet bankable funding requirements (Bappenas, 2018b).

To achieve green growth development projects, GGGI created an analytical tool that will assist the Indonesian government in designing and prioritizing project development through the Green Growth Assessment Process (GGAP). This project uses an Extended Cost-Benefit Analysis (eCBA), which was tested in Phase 1, eCBA can later help financial institutions as well as the Government of Indonesia to make informed decisions regarding project selection and establish Public-Private Partnership/PPP. This eCBA can help identify risk assessments and see opportunities and potential benefits from investing in clean and efficient technology (Bappenas, 2018b). Based on this implementation, we can see that GGGI assistance in the SEZ establishment addresses the green growth challenges related to sustainable development. In

this case, developing SEZ also targets the whole issue, such as reducing poverty by providing green jobs, ensuring environmental sustainability through energy diversification, and reducing GHG emissions.

In addition to the eCBA program, the capacity building by GGGI is carried out in collaboration with the Green Climate Fund (GCF) as a funding investor support program for developing green growth in Indonesia. The GCF was established to allocate UNFCCC funds and provide opportunities for Indonesia to develop green growth programs. GGGI will help the Indonesian government access GCF resources through nationally designated agencies (NDA). Until the end of 2016, GGGI could access GCF resources to access those used in Indonesia (GGGI, 2018). GGGI also helped the Indonesian government establish a green growth funding mechanism through the GCF to reduce risks in implementing green investments. This funding mechanism is also designed as an investment guide to achieve green development goals in Indonesia (Kristianto, 2020). Through Capacity Building, GGGI can become a forum for green investment funding in Indonesia. GGGI, in this case, offers the opportunity for member countries to access these funds with appropriate use, namely by adjusting funding applications to each country's needs (GGGI, 2018). These national financial facilities will later be able to help Indonesia in implementing green programs. GGGI's involvement in Indonesia involves the Ministry of Finance by creating inclusive and sustainable projects. The Ministry of Finance has the necessary authority when risk reduction instruments and monetary policy are to be designed or

developed; the Fiscal Policy Agency will later become the primary reference in fiscal policy.

In this case, GGGI assisted Indonesia through this mechanism with many stakeholders, such as the Ministry of Environment and Forestry, the Ministry of National Planning, the Fiscal Policy Agency, the Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources, the State Administration Agency, and the Ministry of Finance. GGGI also collaborates with an infrastructure development bank (PT. Sarana Multi Infrastruktur) to support the development of Green Projects to make them bankable. At the provincial level, GGGI is also partnering with Central Kalimantan, East Kalimantan province, to continue the Phase 1 program. The aim is to strengthen the institutional capacity system at the provincial level to regulate and measure green growth performance at a higher legal level. Thus, this step can be applied more broadly to projects at the district level and in two pilot provinces in Indonesia. GGGI focuses on providing space to support financial, business, and technical model development for pre-feasibility studies during the green growth program project design process. This is included in State Monitoring as consultation and evaluation services. GGGI will also help connect investors to help with fund structuring and access to capital (Bappenas, 2018b).

Through the management approach, GGGI also conducted the monitoring state by helping to monitor green growth programs in Indonesia by adopting the Risk Management Framework (RMF). In 2017, RMF was formed by combining risk awareness and culture as a mitigation measure carried out by GGGI for Indonesia. GGGI is also

working with local governments to eliminate risks associated with GGGI's mandate and taking initial steps in green growth program engagement. To anticipate risks, GGGI implements a Risk Management Matrix, which is used to assess mitigation measures that can be monitored through GGGI. The Risk Management Matrix aims to foster a culture of awareness of the risks that occur and to determine how the risk management process is in implementing green growth programs in Indonesia. GGGI has also adopted policies to ensure administrative solid and corporate management through the RMF and implemented a zero-tolerance policy towards corruption, fraud, coercion, and collusion cases. As well as guaranteeing the rights of staff to a work environment free from discrimination.

GGGI acts as a companion to create a conducive investment climate and mobilize green investment so that the designed projects run well, providing maximum results for Indonesia's Green Growth program. In assisting green growth programs, GGGI, stationed in its member countries, conveys specific policy and program recommendations for the country. The green growth program in Indonesia is designed to support Indonesia in achieving its Nawa Cita and international commitments through the NDC and SDG. Phase 1 of the Green Growth program comprehensively prepares ways to obtain more investment through green growth programs. By utilizing this phase 1 program, the achievements of the Bankable Green project will be realized, and access to a broader range of climate and green funds (GGGI, 2018). From this monitoring system, we argue that GGGI and

Indonesia are directed to address the issue of climate change impacts and green jobs. With the green investment, green industries will increase and open the opportunities for employment.

In this case, Indonesia invests in forestry to adapt to climate change and benefits green jobs. Renewable Energy and Forestry investments offer significant opportunities for creating green jobs in developing countries by maximizing renewable energy investments that can generate profits for 5-10 years of work. In this case, the Indonesian government has launched the Indonesia Climate Change Sectoral, which focuses on climate change through the RPJMN scheme (Bappenas, 2018a). Some examples of green jobs in Indonesia are Geothermal Exploration Specialists and Waste Recyclers with Decent Working Conditions in Well-Organized Cooperatives (Bappenas, 2018a). The success of implementing green jobs in Indonesia is by training at least 30,000 civil servants about green growth in Indonesia and increasing the green jobs program in the SEZ region (GGGI, 2018).

GGGI reported on green growth priorities, which were still 21% of the NDC target due to the COVID-19 crisis. So, Indonesia needs to increase investment in the private sector, increase public investment, and maximize green climate funding. The Indonesian government has conveyed its target to achieve a net sink scheme in the FO-LU sector by 2030 through the document Indonesia Long-Term Strategy For Low Carbon and Climate Resilience 2050 (Indonesia LTS-LCCR 2050). FOLU Net Sink is the condition that Indonesia wants to achieve through GGGI to reduce GHG from the forestry and land use sectors

(GGGI, 2021). The FOLU Net Sink target will be achieved by reducing forest damage, deforestation, and peatland damage, which will emit GHG (Satbyul, 2014). It is hoped that the efforts made will be able to provide an increase in reducing deforestation from secondary forest growth, deforestation activities, and reforestation activities. The Indonesian government's program towards Net Zero Emissions is explained in the road map, which provides a mandate regarding the massive development of renewable energy (Satbyul, 2014). Technology and innovation are expected to be the main drivers in creating jobs and a clean environment (Sugiono, 2014).

GGGI, in providing green growth assistance to Indonesia, has succeeded in developing clean energy of 600-1000 MW through sustainable infrastructure development in the SEZs area, intending to reduce CO₂ in the area (GGGI, 2021). This program can run well and is able to provide a reduction of 400 million tonnes of CO₂ emissions in non-peat forestry landscapes and 200 million tonnes of CO₂ emissions in peat landscapes covering an area of 1 million hectares. This is one of the achievements of the green growth program in Indonesia through assistance provided by GGGI (GGGI, 2021).

Last but not least, in terms of monitoring state, GGGI is collaborating with the Ministry of Environment and Forestry to launch the Indonesia-Aussie Forest Carbon Accounting System/INCAS system. This system provides monitoring of land use changes. This INCAS system will produce monitoring related to the development of green land in Indonesia annually. To carry out active monitoring and respond quickly, monitoring needs to

be carried out and is known as "DETER" (Bappenas, 2018a). This system functions to monitor and detect forest deforestation within 15 days and helps identify points of deforestation and environmental damage. Environmental and natural resources institutions will target law enforcement efforts based on data recorded through the DETER system. This system prevents potential deforestation violations and is the main tool for supporting green growth policies. GGGI, in this case, also encourages Indonesian producers to fulfill stricter certification to open access to a broader international scope (Bappenas, 2018a). The efforts to strengthen compliance with legal regulations can help ensure the sustainability of reducing deforestation in Indonesia. Likewise, with ISPO certification, Indonesia also strengthens it by giving legal obligations to suppliers to comply with ISPO. It is also strengthened by providing legal obligations as a requirement so that suppliers can operate in accordance with international rules (GGGI, 2021).

Normative Approach

Aligning the national and international rules, GGGI also supports Indonesia in the legal adjustment. Together with the Government of Indonesia, GGGI was involved in drafting the applicable laws to minimize fraud in implementing green growth policies in Indonesia since it concluded its Phase I collaboration in 2015 (GGGI, 2022). GGGI collaborated with the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Environment and Forestry to implement a green growth legal program. The Ministry of Finance will later be responsible for managing, monitoring, and evaluating project

performance on a legal basis to ensure the effective use of resources through the Environmental Fund Management Agency. Meanwhile, the Ministry of Environment and Forestry will implement activities to produce an agreement between GGGI and the Ministry of Environment and Forestry to reduce deforestation and control forest and forest and land fires (KLHK, 2021).

Increasing the number and capacity of environmental law enforcers aims to increase investigations into the application of sanctions. Punishments can be fines, arrest, embargo, destruction of production materials, and confiscation (GGGI, 2018). At the national level, the basic rules of Indonesian law stipulated internationally are used to identify areas experiencing massive deforestation so that appropriate assistance is needed. By copying the steps taken by other GGGI member countries, this move will improve forestry sector governance and help reduce the number of environmental crimes.

Specifically, the laws will be implemented to protect the SEZs. Three main policies for designing Special Green Economic Zones aim to contribute to broad green economic growth (Bappenas, 2018b). The first policy is to provide incentives for green programs to enter SEZ areas, and this will help provide incentives and be able to manage good funds, including imported and exported manufactured products (GGGI, 2018). Second, designing a green economic growth policy for all SEZs at the initial planning stage with policy regulations to achieve the goal of overall SEZ development. The third is to regulate economic activities, provide incentives, and regulate economic activities to

attract green technology and innovation in the SEZ area. These three policies will later be able to produce SEZ policies to reduce the risks of green investment by reducing costs for investors (Bappenas, 2018b). With the commitments that have been designed, it is expected to be able to open doors of opportunities for foreign investment and achieve high connectivity with stakeholders. This can also contribute significantly to the results of green economic growth in Indonesia (GGGI, 2022). In Indonesia, several economic areas have been implemented, including Integrated Economic Development Area (Kawasan Pengembangan Ekonomi Terpadu/KAPET), Bonded Zone (Kawasan Berikat/KB), Free Trade and Free Harbor Zone (Kawasan Perdagangan Bebas dan Pelabuhan Bebas/KPBPB) and Industrial Zone (Kawasan Industri/KI).

Enforcement Approach

The Naming and Shaming approach is a strategy for International Organizations to generate compliance. This Enforcement Approach emphasizes how international organizations enforce rules and invite countries to behave according to international norms independently (Joachim et al., 2008: 9). The capacity of international organizations to encourage countries to comply with international norms is an obligation that has been agreed upon in international forums. However, in analyzing GGGI's involvement in helping Indonesia achieve a successful green growth program, the Enforcement Approach is not too significant to be used in analyzing the program. Basically, Indonesia has complied with international rules and agreed to an agreement dealing with

climate change problems. Indonesia has also committed to the Paris Agreement to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and reduce environmental deforestation.

Through the legal regulations implemented in Indonesia in the Paris Agreement, Indonesia will continue to play an active role in conveying its commitment and success in reducing GHG emissions within the UNFCCC framework. This is also reflected in Indonesia's G20 priorities, especially in the energy transition. Indonesia has also encouraged sustainable green growth programs in the energy and non-energy sectors by encouraging various investment schemes, such as mixed funding from various parties such as investors, government, and institutions, and funding in various business sectors outside green development. This is also supported by several short-term, medium-term, and long-term strategic recommendations that have been designed, the aim of which is to be able to consider achieving sustainable green growth in accordance with international rules. In this case, even though there are many challenges to implementing the green growth program in Indonesia, it does not mean that the government is silent. Looking at how the Indonesian government tried to collaborate with international actors and reached out to its local government, Indonesia has demonstrated significant action. In short, Indonesia does not ignore international agreements and its national commitments. Therefore, instead of using the enforcement approach, GGGI collaborates with Indonesia through the management and normative approaches.

CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis results in this study, it is concluded that the efforts made by the Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI) in implementing the green growth program in Indonesia in 2014-2020 were carried out in collaboration with various stakeholders. The approach taken by GGGI through the management, normative, and enforcement approaches has yielded maximum results in several sectors. In this case, the management approach focuses on how an international organization helps the state to improve its capacities and capabilities through good governance and management implementation. Secondly, the normative approach emphasizes how an international organization assists the country in strengthening its regulation framework to align with the global norms. Lastly, the enforcement approach refers to naming and shaming the country when it does not obey international rules and regulations. Through the management approach, GGGI took an approach through problem-solving, which is carried out to monitor the country and capacity building that focuses on the establishment of Special Economic Zones to ensure the achievement of sustainable development, the implementation of the funding scheme for green investment to address the challenges of green jobs availability and climate change impacts. Through a

normative approach, GGGI has collaborated with the Indonesian government to apply the rule of law so that the green growth program runs safely and complies with international rules. GGGI, in this case, and the Indonesian government stipulated standard laws that resulted in the attainment of foreign capital provision in Port facilities. However, it was found that the enforcement approach was not clearly implemented because the Government of Indonesia appeared to be cooperative with its commitments, namely carrying out the GHG reduction and green growth obligations in accordance with national regulations.

We hope that further research about international collaboration regarding the implementation of green growth programs in Indonesia can be more focused on the effectiveness of the actions. While the legal basis and the national framework have been established within the cooperation since 2014, it is necessary to see how effective it is in helping Indonesia to achieve both national targets and fulfill its international commitments.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors thank the Center for ASEAN Research on Energy (CARE) and the Department of International Relations Universitas Pertamina for their support in conducting this research.

REFERENCES

Azhari, J. N. (2020). *Upaya Pemerintah Indonesia dalam Mewujudkan Ekonomi Hijau Melalui Program*

REDD+ di Kawasan Taman Nasional Sebangau Kalimantan Tengah. Malang: Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang.

- Bappenas. (2018a). "HCA Pemerintah Indonesia-GGGI Disahkan, Perkuat Upaya Pertumbuhan Hijau Di Indonesia." Accessed from <http://greengrowth.bappenas.go.id/hca-pemerintah-indonesia-gggi-disahkan-perkuat-upaya-pertumbuhan-hijau-di-indonesia/>.
- Bappenas. (2018b). "Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Hijau Dan Perencanaan Investasi: Panduan untuk Menggunakan Analisis Biaya - Manfaat yang Diperluas (eCBA)." Accessed from http://greengrowth.bappenas.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/Pertumbuhan-Ekonomi-Hijau-dan-Perencanaan-Investasi_ID_2016.pdf.
- GGGI. (2015). "Mewujudkan Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Hijau untuk Indonesia yang Sejahtera: SINTESIS, Sebuah Peta Jalan untuk Kebijakan, Perencanaan dan Investasi." Accessed from http://greengrowth.bappenas.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/20160510161722.GGGI_Roadmap_Synthesis_Ind_lores_spread.pdf
- GGGI. (2018). "Review of GGGI Programme in Indonesia 2012-2017: Final Report 27 March 2018." Accessed from <https://gggi.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Norway-2018-mid-term-evaluation-of-GGGI-Indonesia-Final-report.pdf>
- GGGI. (2021). "GGGI Technical Report No. 19 September 2021 Green Recovery and Climate Action: Assessing Green Jobs from Renewable Energy and Forestry Investments for Developing and Emerging Economies." Accessed from https://gggi.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/WEB_GGGI-Technical-Report-No-19-Green-Jobs_FINAL_v02.pdf
- GGGI. (2022). "Tentang Kami". Accessed from <http://greengrowth.bappenas.go.id/tentang-kami/>
- Joachim, J., Reinalda, B., Verbeek, B. (2008). International Organizations and Implementation: Pieces of the Puzzle. In Joachim, J., Reinalda, B., Verbeek, B. (Ed.), *International Organizations and Implementation: Enforcers, Managers or Authorities* (pp. 1-18). London and New York: Routledge.
- Kasztelan, A. (2017). Green Growth, Green Economy And Sustainable Development: Terminological And Relational Discourse. *Prague Economic Papers*, 26(4), 487-499.
- KLHK. (2021). *Kerangka Kerja Investasi untuk Mengurangi Emisi dari Deforestasi dan Degradasi Hutan serta Peran Konservasi, Pengelolaan Hutan Berkelanjutan dan Peningkatan Stok Karbon Hutan (REDD+) di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Direktorat Jenderal Pengendalian Perubahan Iklim, Kementerian Lingkungan Hidup dan Kehutanan.
- Kristianto, A. H. (2020). Sustainable Development Goals (Sdgs) dalam

- Konsep Green Economy untuk
Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Berkualitas
Berbasis Ekologi. *Business,
Economics and Entrepreneurship*,
2(1), 27-38.
- Saepudin, A., Muryantini, S., &
Maghfiroh, H. D. (2020). Kebijakan
Indonesia Dalam Mewujudkan
Industri Hijau (Green Industry)
Masa Pemerintahan Presiden Joko
Widodo. *Jurnal EKSOS*, 2(2), 166-
177.
- O'Donnell, K. (2012). *The Global Green
Growth Institute: On a Mission to
Prove Green Growth*. New York:
Council of Foreign Relations.
- Satbyul, K. E., Ho, K., Yeora, C. (2014). A
New Approach to Measuring Green
Growth: Application to the OECD
and Korea. *Futures*, 63, 37-48.
- Sihaloho, T., & Muna, N. (2010). Kajian
Dampak Ekonomi Pembentukan
Kawasan Ekonomi Khusus. *Buletin
Ilmiah Litbang Perdagangan*, 4(1),
75-101.
[https://doi.org/10.30908/bilp.v4i
1.150](https://doi.org/10.30908/bilp.v4i1.150)
- Sugiyono, A., Anindhita, A., Boedoyo, M.
S., & Adiarso, A. (2014). *Indonesia
Energy Outlook 2014: Energy
Development in Supporting Fuel
Substitution Program*. Jakarta:
Pusat Teknologi Pengembangan
Sumberdaya Energi & Badan
Pengkajian dan Penerapan
Teknologi.